

SIDA Evaluation Report, Public Administration in Zimbabwe

1991/4

KEEPING THE GOALS IN SIGHT

An Evaluation of Swedish Support to Public Administration in Zimbabwe



By Lennart Gustafsson, Peter Blunt, Duduzile Chandiwana,
Peter Gisle, Charles Katiza, Desire Sibanda, Stefan Sjölander and Robert Tendere



This evaluation was carried out in November 1990 by an independent study team consisting of:

Dr Lennart Gustafsson, Professor Peter Biant,
Daduzile Chatidwana, Charles Katiza, Peter Ginde,
Desire Sihanda, Stefan Sjölander and Robert Tendere.

The views and interpretations expressed in this report are those of the authors and should not be attributed to the Swedish International Development Authority, SIDA.

General Editor: Annika Idemalm

Editing: David Strömberg

Copyright: SIDA and the authors

Printed by: Gotah 1991

ISBN 91-586-7136-6

ISSN 0283-6270

SIDA Evaluation Report 1991/4, Public Administration in Zimbabwe

Keeping the Goals in Sight

An Evaluation of Swedish Support to Public Administration in Zimbabwe

by

Lennart Gustafsson

Peter Blunt

Duduzile Chandirwana

Peter Gisle

Charles Katiza

Desire Sibanda

Stefan Sjölander

Robert Tendere

SIDA
Stockholm 1991

ZIMBABWE



TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	6
1 INTRODUCTION	8
1.1 Background to the Study	8
1.2 Terms of Reference	9
1.3 The Study Team	10
1.4 The Structure of the Report	10
1.5 A Note on Method	10
2 REFORMS AFFECTING THE PUBLIC SERVICE IN ZIMBABWE	11
2.1 The Public Service Review Commission	11
2.2 The Macroeconomic Reform Programme	11
2.3 Other steps to increase efficiency	11
2.4 Assessment and conclusion	12
3 REVIEW OF INDIVIDUAL SUB-PROGRAMMES	13
3.1 Zimbabwe Institute of Public Administration and Management	13
3.2 Ministry of the Public Service	16
3.3 Local Government	18
3.4 Department of Physical Planning	21
3.5 The Office of the Comptroller and Auditor General	23
3.6 Department of Taxes	25
3.7 Central Statistics Office	26
3.8 Ministry of Community and Cooperative Development	28
4 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUTURE SECTOR SUPPORT	32
4.1 Assessment of Present Sector Support	32
4.2 Institutional Cooperation	32
4.3 The Project Cycle	34
4.4 Possible Areas of Future Cooperation	36
ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS	38
TERMS OF REFERENCE	39

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The support provided by SIDA to the Public Administration Sector can be broken down into eight sub-programmes each one having a recipient institution. They are: the Zimbabwe Institute of Public Administration (ZIPAM), the Ministry of Public Service, the Ministry of Local Government, Rural and Urban Development (MLGRUD), the Department of Physical Planning, the Office of the Comptroller and Auditor General, the Department of Taxes, the Central Statistics Office and the Ministry of Community and Cooperative Development.

In November 1990 a joint sector study was carried out to review the relevance of the present Swedish support paying particular attention to the recommendations presented by the Public Service Review Commission (PSRC) and to other factors affecting the developments of the Zimbabwean public service. The study group was required to make proposals for continued sector support based on identified needs and, where necessary, make recommendations as to change the composition of the support.

The study reviewed current reform programmes in the Zimbabwean public administration and recommended that SIDA strengthen its monitoring of the implementation and development of these programmes. The strategic plans for the respective sub-programmes should take account of these developments.

The study group also concluded that all sub-programmes are useful and relevant in relation to PSRC, SIDA policy guidelines for cooperation in the field of public administration and trends in public service development in Zimbabwe. Several programmes have, however, deviated from their long term institutional development objectives and ought to be reformulated.

The team found that institutional cooperation reveals considerable differences between cases of pure "twinning" of sister organisations in Sweden and Zimbabwe and more traditional consultancy services.

It was found that the key issue for an efficient cooperation was not so much the form of institutional cooperation but the proceeding strategic analysis. Some sub-programmes have been lacking in this respect.

Institutional development objectives are most easily observed in pure twinning or in

technical areas. Other forms of institutional cooperation could be as relevant as twinning but demand greater efforts during project identification, formulation and monitoring.

As several sub-programmes have deviated from their long term objectives it is recommended that the project identification and formulation processes are strengthened. The development of a strategic plan by senior management on both sides ought to be part of this exercise.

Project organisation and implementation could be strengthened if a long term adviser and coordinator — when appropriate — has personal experience of the mother consultancy agency. This is particularly important when the institutional cooperation is based on the transfer of Swedish experiences to the Zimbabwean partner.

Steering groups, coordinating committees, etc have proved to be a practical way to coordinate operational activities in projects.

As several sub-programmes have strayed from their long term objectives it is recommended that the monitoring process is strengthened:

- top management of cooperating agencies ought to get together and review progress regularly
- SIDA should strengthen its monitoring.

In many cases too much faith is put in training as compared to other forms of institutional development (organizational development, leadership training, systems development).

The study group recommends continued support to the Task Force set up by Government to implement the recommendations by the PSRC.

The group also suggests possible future cooperation in financial management and in gender and labour market issues (industrial relations).

In four cases — ZIPAM, Ministry of Public Service, Local Government and Department of Physical Planning — the Study recommends a "new start" based on a project identification mission or a similar activity which would include renewed strategic discussions on senior level.

A review of the objectives of the cooperation programme with the Comptroller and Auditor General is recommended in light of on-going reforms in the public service, especially the Macroeconomic Programme. This should be done before the project starts.

The programmes in the Department of Taxes and the Central Statistical Office function very well and are recommended to continue more or less as they now stand.

The cooperation with the Ministry of Community and Cooperation Development should be continued but more attention be devoted to setting objectives.

In summary the study underlines the importance of strengthening the strategic dimension in all phases of the project cycle and emphasises institutional development in institutional cooperation.

Chapter 1

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background to the Study

The support provided by SIDA to the Public Administration Sector in Zimbabwe can be broken down into eight sub-programmes each one having a recipient institution. These institutions are:

- Zimbabwe Institute of Public Administration and Management (ZIPAM)
- Ministry of the Public Service (MPS)
- Ministry of Local Government Rural and Urban Development (MLGRUD)
- Department of Physical Planning (DPP)
- Office of the Comptroller and Auditor General (CAG)
- Department of Taxes
- Central Statistics Office (CSO)
- Ministry of Community and Cooperative Development (MCCD)

In all of the sub-programmes support is aimed at strengthening the recipient institutions. The support is provided via an institutional cooperation arrangement involving public agencies in Sweden.

The present sector support agreement between Sweden and Zimbabwe expires in June 1991. Since the signing of the last three year agreement it has become clear that the public service in Zimbabwe is on the threshold of fundamental change. The impetus for such change stems from the adoption by the government of Zimbabwe of a macro economic reform programme which incorporates a requirement for a reduction in the size of the public service; and the recent decision by the government to embark on a public service reform programme based on the findings of the Public Service Review Commission (PSRC).

In May 1990 during the Annual Consultations, the Government of Zimbabwe and SIDA also agreed on a joint sector study to review the relevance of present Swedish support to the public administration sector, paying particular attention to the recommendations presented by the PSRC. The next agreement of support to the public sector in Zimbabwe was said to be based on the outcome of the study



*The government has recently approved the Public Sector Review Commission's recommendations. A Task Force has been set up to make the public sector more responsive to the public, more decentralized and more effective.
Photo: Gustaf Eneroth, Bazaar Photo Agency.*

1.2 Terms of Reference

The terms of reference state that: "The study shall analyse the relevance of the present composition of the Public Administration Sector Support in relation to the recommendations put forward by the Public Service Review Commission as adopted by the Government of Zimbabwe; SIDA's policy guidelines for cooperation in the field of public administration; and current trends in the public sector as identified by the study team." In addition, the terms of reference state that the study team shall "provide the Zimbabwean ministries and SIDA with information on the strengths and weaknesses of present institutional cooperation/twinning arrangements..." Finally, the study was required to make proposals "for continued sector support based on ... identified needs... (and) where necessary, recommendations as to change in the composition of ... support." The complete terms of reference are attached.

1.3 The Study Team

The study was carried out by eight persons, four of whom were appointed by the Public Service Commission and four by SIDA. The team consisted of the following individuals:

Appointed by SIDA:

Dr Lennart Gustafsson, Team Leader and Head of the National Fund for Administrative Development and Training for Government Employees, Sweden.

Professor Peter Blunt, Northern Territory University, Australia.

Peter Gisle, private Consultant, Sweden.

Stefan Sjölander, Deputy Secretary, Ministry of Finance, Sweden.

Appointed by the PSC:

Charles Katiza, Deputy Permanent Secretary, MLGRUD.

Robert Tendere, Deputy Director, Central Statistics Office.

Mrs Duduzile Chandiwana, Under Secretary, Ministry of Community and Cooperative Development.

Desire Sibanda, Head of Division, ZIPAM.

The mission conducted its field work during the month of November, 1990.

1.4 The Structure of the Report

The report consists of four chapters. Chapter 1 sets out the study's background and rationale, terms of reference, team composition, report structure, and method. Chapter 2 provides a more detailed account of some of the major reforms affecting the future of the public service in Zimbabwe. Chapter 3, which constitutes the bulk of the report, contains assessments and recommendations concerning each of the eight sub-programmes. Drawing on the more detailed information contained in the previous chapter, Chapter 4 presents general conclusions regarding the preferred nature and management of future Swedish support, as well as outlining a number of areas of possible future support.

1.5 A Note on Method

Our primary means of collecting data were semi-structured individual and group interviews, complemented by field visits to rural and urban areas outside of Harare, and existing written reports pertaining to each of the sub-programmes.

Each sub-programme was reviewed by a three-person group comprising two SIDA appointed consultants (one of whom acted as group leader) and one Zimbabwean appointed consultant.

The individual components (training courses, manuals, training materials etc), have not been systematically "evaluated" by the team but attention has of course been given to the reports of those evaluations which have been carried out.

Chapter 2

REFORMS AFFECTING THE PUBLIC SERVICE IN ZIMBABWE

It is difficult to predict precisely the effects of the public service reform in Zimbabwe. Nevertheless, it seems certain that whatever the outcomes new demands will be placed upon Swedish support. Among the factors most likely to have an influence on the nature of such demands are the report of the Public Service Review (PSRC), and the proposed macro economic reform programme.

2.1 The Public Service Review Commission

The government of Zimbabwe has recently approved some 120 recommendations from the PSRC and set up a Task Force to implement the recommendations. This is in line with the report's general thrust, which is to create a new style of public service in Zimbabwe, that is, one which is more responsive to the public, more change-oriented, more proactive, more decentralized, more committed to establishing links between service and reward, and generally more concerned with effectiveness and efficiency.

2.2 The Macroeconomic Reform Programme

The government has committed itself to a major macro economic reform programme. The programme, whose operational components are under preparation, covers several key areas: trade liberalization; fiscal stabilization; and the deregulation of certain key sectors.

Of these, the fiscal stabilization programme may carry the most significant consequences since it envisages a dramatic reduction in the size of the public service.

2.3 Other steps to increase efficiency

A third feature of the changing face of the public service in Zimbabwe is the implementation of various measures to increase efficiency.

initiatives to develop the very institutions which are responsible for enhancing efficiency. Examples of such changes are:

- the Auditor General who is moving into performance auditing;
- the Ministry of Public Service, which is developing its capabilities to provide consultancy services to line ministries;
- a "new" ZIPAM, which as a parastatal intends to move beyond mere training into consultancy; and
- efficiency units to be established to review different sectors of the public administration

2.4 Assessment and conclusion

Despite the aforementioned difficulties of prediction, there are clear implications in the above for close monitoring by SIDA of the implementation and development of the reform programmes in the public service, and therefore for frequent and effective communication with the MPS in order that the support provided may be adjusted to changing circumstances. As we argue more fully in subsequent chapters, strategic planning for individual programmes should take account of such developments.

Chapter 3

REVIEW OF INDIVIDUAL SUB-PROGRAMMES

3.1 Zimbabwe Institute of Public Administration and Management

3.1.1. Background

ZIPAM was established in 1984. In 1987, a reorganization of the training function within the Zimbabwean Public Service resulted in the disbandment of the Training Management Bureau within the Ministry of the Public Service (MPS). Most Training Management Bureau training staff were transferred to ZIPAM. Up to that time, Swedish Government assistance to training within the Zimbabwean Public Service had been channelled through an association between SIPU and Training Management Bureau. With the disappearance of the Training Management Bureau in 1987, SIPU established a formal partnership with ZIPAM. This partnership, which began in April 1988, was based on a two-year agreement concerning the provision of consultancy services for training in the Zimbabwean Public Service. Since then, SIPU has either delivered, or assisted with the delivery of, a wide variety of training programmes, and produced a range of course materials.

3.1.2. Objectives

The objectives of this programme of cooperation originally were:

- to develop training capability generally within the Zimbabwean Public Service;
- to develop specific training programmes for areas of strategic significance; and
- to improve the physical infrastructure for public service training.

3.1.3. Project Organization

In January 1988, a four day planning session involving the then director of ZIPAM and representatives of SIPU was held. This resulted in the production of a strategic plan.

To date, there has been one long term adviser assigned to ZIPAM. His period of tenure, which lasted for just under one year, terminated recently. His place has been

taken by a second long term adviser. Both of these advisers have been SIPU appointed consultants rather than members of SIPU *per se*. Otherwise, contact between SIPU and ZIPAM has consisted primarily of short-term consultancy visits, periodic reviews and progress reports, and the like.

In the near future, ZIPAM will assume some form of parastatal status and, as a result of the recent retirement of its director, a new director will be appointed.

3.1.4. Assessment

The performance of ZIPAM in its at present limited sphere of operation has been variable. We came across a variety of evidence which suggests that ZIPAM suffers from problems of credibility in the eyes of at least some of its client organizations. Nevertheless, ZIPAM could become an important vehicle of administrative reform in the Zimbabwean Public Sector. Like MPS, ZIPAM should contribute significantly to the realization of the recommendations of the PSRC report. Civil service training together with still underdeveloped areas of ZIPAM operation (such as applied research and consultancy), are central to the new era of operational style and effectiveness presaged by the report of the PSRC. In more general terms, many public services in developing countries derive considerable benefit from organizations like ZIPAM, and we believe that Zimbabwe is no different in this respect.

The sub-programme is in principle clearly compatible with SIDA's guidelines for cooperation in the field of public administration, although more could perhaps be done — as indicated below — to ensure appropriate levels of contextualisation, applied problem solving, basic need satisfaction, and follow-up.

There is general consensus on both sides regarding the uniformly high quality of training course delivery on the part of SIPU. On the other hand the management of the relationship between SIPU and ZIPAM appears increasingly not to have received the attention it deserves. That is to say, the effort devoted in early 1988 by SIPU and ZIPAM to the development of a long term strategic plan has not been followed through sufficiently. It would appear that the production of the strategic plan may have been treated simply as another discrete short-term consultancy.

There have, however, been undeniable difficulties in establishing and maintaining a reasonable working relationship between the two institutions. Not the least of these have been the high levels of turnover among professional staff at ZIPAM and the less than certain status of the institution within the public service system as a whole. Added to this have been problems arising from the short period of tenure (less than one year) of the first long term adviser.

In brief ZIPAM has not had sufficient opportunity to fully benefit from the assistance, partly because of the unsatisfactory management of the relationship between SIPU and ZIPAM and partly because of the relatively short duration of that relationship.

We are, nevertheless, hopeful that ZIPAM will achieve in the not too distant future a strategic direction which is consistent with desirable trends in the Zimbabwean Public

Service. We believe that the transition of ZIPAM to a parastatal and other important changes of its organization will facilitate such an orientation. We are also persuaded that SIDA should continue its support of ZIPAM via an appropriately designed and managed partnership with SIPU. In arriving at this conclusion, however, we were equally persuaded of the necessity for a "new start". Our views concerning essential ingredients of a new relationship between SIPU and ZIPAM are set out below.

3.1.5. Conclusions and Recommendations

As with a number of the other sub-programmes referred to in this report, there is a clear need in this case to restore and sustain open communication between the two partners at a senior level. The creation and maintenance of "live" strategic dialogue is the cornerstone of our recommendations. We recommend that:

- a) In accordance with its proposed broader consultancy role, ZIPAM develop a more proactive stance in relation to its activities and potential clients. In due course the change to parastatal status will require this, but we have in mind ZIPAM's being prepared for this eventuality rather than reacting to it. This will entail in ZIPAM itself the development of an organizational culture which is consistent with that referred to in the report of the PSRC: that is, one which is change oriented, proactive rather than reactive, flexible, and committed to high levels of individual and organizational effectiveness. Indeed, such developments are essential if ZIPAM, or any other training institute, is to contribute effectively to the realization of the recommendations of the PSRC and the creation of a more responsible and effective Zimbabwean Public Service.
- b) Mechanisms for joint strategic planning and dialogue at a senior level should be put in place as soon as possible and kept in effective working order. The production, and continual updating, of a written strategic plan would constitute an important element of this dialogue. The establishment of such a strategic planning mechanism should help to resolve and prevent many of the problems of resource allocation, and communication, reported to us during our investigations.
- c) Joint managerial mechanisms (with short and medium term foci) be put in place to ensure the operationalization and coordination of activities and initiatives arising out of (b) above.
- d) In order to facilitate culture building and the development of a new orientation in ZIPAM, the role of the long-term SIPU consultant should be defined more broadly and more flexibly so as to allow for contributions and involvement in areas other than the Management Development Programme (MDP). Here, the team had in mind the joint development in ZIPAM of consultancy and applied research and publication, as well as training, and national and international networking.
- e) In order to optimize the contributions of long-term consultants, their periods of tenure should, with periodic performance reviews, be not less than two years.

f) Strong consideration be given in strategic planning to ways and means of enhancing ZIPAM's consultancy and applied research activities as this would enhance the relevance and quality of ZIPAM training activities. We also feel that this is an important part of creating in the eyes of client organizations and prospective and existing ZIPAM staff an image of an effective, dynamic, and worthwhile organization.

g) Ways should be explored of reinvigorating training activities, and making them more applied and relevant. A number of the people we interviewed felt that training has tended to become too routinized, and in some cases remains a little too academic. This has implications for modes of training delivery as well as training needs analysis and, perhaps most importantly, training follow-up.

To reiterate and conclude, our view is that, providing the foregoing recommendations are seriously considered, ZIPAM will become an important means for bringing about positive change in public administration and management in Zimbabwe, and therefore deserves continued support from SIDA.

3.2 Ministry of the Public Service

3.2.1. Background

Cooperation between Zimbabwe and Sweden in the field of public service training began in 1983. It aims to enhance the effectiveness of the public sector.

Initially, the support provided took the form of an institutional development programme involving the Training Management Bureau (TMB) of the MPS and the National Institute for Civil Service Training and Development, SIPU, which was appointed as the Swedish counterpart organization. In 1987, TMB ceased to exist. Most of the TMB training staff was transferred to ZIPAM, as was the institutional relationship with SIPU.

3.2.2. Objectives

The objectives of the cooperation between SIPU and TMB/ZIPAM are:

- to develop and improve the organization of and the methods for public service training;
- to develop training programmes for selected areas of strategic importance; and
- to establish an improved physical infrastructure for public service training.

3.2.3. Project Organization

During the relatively long period of cooperation between SIPU and MPS, assistance has been directed primarily toward improving the knowledge and skills of staff, developing courses and training materials, and equipping training institutions. More recently a

certain amount of systems development has taken place (e.g. a Personnel Manual). Assistance has been delivered mainly in the form of short term consultancies, study tours, and equipment.

There has never been a SIPU coordinator per se resident in Harare. SIPU activities have been, and are, coordinated by an official at SIPU headquarters, who visits Zimbabwe several times a year. Within the MPS, one official is charged with coordinating the administrative aspects of the MPS/SIPU relationship.

3.2.4. Assessment

The quality of institutional cooperation between SIPU and the MPS appears to have been adversely affected by the transfer of training responsibilities from TMB to ZIPAM. One consequence seems to have been that the relationship lost key elements of its major institution building purpose, and became instead a more traditional client/consultant relationship. This has meant also that this sub-programme has strayed from the principles for institutional cooperation laid down in SIDA's policy guidelines.

At present, the relationship between MPS and SIPU would appear to consist in responses by SIPU to requests received from MPS which are presented on the occasion of annual reviews. MPS seems to consider SIDA as its counterpart and views SIPU as just one among several potential consultants and training organizations. To us this suggests that the institution building elements of the cooperation have been lost. The absence of a resident SIPU representative may have contributed to the changing relationship.

However, we have been informed that SIPU and MPS are in the process of re-establishing a relationship which is more in line with SIDA guidelines and gives emphasis to institutional development.

We consider the MPS to be a key component of the machinery for realizing the spirit and the letter of the recommendations of the report of the PSRC. Its structural proximity to the Implementation Unit (IU), its involvement in the revision of personnel rules and regulations, the devolution of certain personnel matters to the line ministries, and the provision of support to them, reinforces this view.

Moreover, the MPS has already taken several steps to implement the recommendations made by the PSRC, including:

- the development of a personnel manual and plans to train line ministry staff in its use;
- a review of the grading system;
- the formulation of a policy on women managers;
- the introduction of a training programme for new recruits to the Management Services Division in order to inculcate in them a consultancy orientation, particularly towards line ministries.

3.2.5. Recommendations

It is our view therefore that there should be continued support of the MPS. However, in any deliberations which take place concerning the nature of that support and the precise form of institutional cooperation, we would like to recommend that:

- a) Some mechanism for ensuring continuing strategic dialogue between the partner organizations be institutionalized in order to facilitate mutual appreciation of the objectives of the cooperation, to resolve problems encountered in attempting to attain these objectives, and to explore and identify areas in which cooperation stands the greatest chance of success.
- b) In order to set in train the process of strategic dialogue, a project identification mission be charged to consult at a senior level within the ministry in order to determine initial directions and areas of focus. Specific areas to be considered might include: training programmes for women managers, the investigation of appropriate performance related reward systems and training in their operation and implementation, the provision of direct support to the MPS itself via long term advisers to the (proposed) Directors of Training and Personnel. This new programme ought to be sufficiently flexible to permit the use of local or regional consultants or any others thought to be suitable.
- c) At the managerial level a long term adviser should be appointed who is resident in Harare and who possesses, in addition to technical skills, a thorough understanding of SIPU and, importantly, well developed interpersonal and managerial skills. While this role would need to be defined more closely than is possible here, it should include responsibility for coordinating short term consultancies, providing technical assistance in the individual's area of expertise, and providing a (but not the only) communication channel between the two partners.
- d) SIPU's contribution to strengthening MPS' capacity to operate in its new consultancy/change agent role should be expanded to incorporate activities other than training. This might include support in organizational design and culture building. In the area of training itself, we feel that there is considerable value to be obtained from giving more emphasis to thorough training needs analyses and to follow-up and evaluation which draws on a broader base of data than that supplied by post training course attitude surveys.

3.3 Local Government

3.3.1. Background

At Independence in 1980 local government in rural areas was divided between white-dominated Rural Councils, and African Councils in the Tribal Trustlands. The latter have since been replaced by District Councils. It has long been the intention of the Zimbabwean Government to amalgamate Rural and District Councils in order to rid the

country of a political anachronism. The cooperation between the Ministry of Local Government, Urban and Rural Development (MLGRUD) and the Swedish Association of Local Authorities (SALA) was founded in 1983 to assist with the process of amalgamation.

3.3.2. Objectives

The objectives of the current project (terms of reference, June 15, 1988) are intended to support the development of local government structures in Zimbabwe. In particular, the assistance is aimed at:

- a) contributing to the establishment of well functioning and viable local authorities through
 - i) advisory support to the amalgamation of the present Rural and District Councils (RDCs), thereby creating a unified local government structure ;
 - ii) the development of new financial, administrative and other systems for the RDCs; and
 - iii) training of RDC staff and officials;
- b) strengthening MLGRUD itself, and especially its Training and Promotion Section.

3.3.3. Project Organization

Assistance has been rendered via a long term adviser, short term consultancies, study tours, systems development, and training courses.

The terms of reference state that the long term adviser should provide "advisory support in relation to the management and coordination of (i) the amalgamation of Rural and District Councils, (ii) the Ministry's training programme for RDC staff and officials and (iii) of the SALA inputs in relation to (i) and (ii)...". The long term consultant was placed in the Training and Promotions Section of the Ministry.

3.3.4. Assessment

A detailed evaluation of this sub-programme was conducted in 1989. One of the conclusions of this evaluation was that MLGRUD had derived considerable benefit from the assistance, particularly in relation to the identification of training needs in rural local authorities, and in overcoming problems related to the progress of training activities.

The project has been successful in other respects too, notably in the production of accounting and information systems handbooks, and an administration handbook. Many of the short term consultancies in training and other areas are also considered to have been of great value to the ministry.

The long term adviser's coordinating and advisory functions (in relation to training) are well appreciated. On the other hand, it would appear his advice on issues relating to the amalgamation process *per se* has not had the impact anticipated in the project objectives.

The dialogue preceding the formulation of the project may have been a contributory factor. It is not clear that there was consensus regarding the role of SALA. We would, in fact, be surprised if the Government really wanted "technical" advice on the politically sensitive aspect of the amalgamation process. There may well have been an understandable reluctance on the part of senior ministry officials to press an issue which they knew to be the subject of considerable debate and lobbying at cabinet level.

Training needs in the ministry have been the subject of a recent major investigation. The report identifies a number of major areas of training need. Although the ministry has yet to respond formally to this report, responses in interview indicate an acceptance at least in some quarters of some of the report's major recommendations.

There are clear, and urgent, short term needs brought about by the transfer of training personnel to another ministry which are not addressed in the report, and we shall return to these needs below.

July, 1991 is the date set for amalgamation in a formal legal sense. The extent and pace of actual administrative and financial amalgamation remains uncertain. It is possible that a small number of pilot amalgamations will take place first in order to pave the way for diffusion to all parts of the country. Once cabinet has determined the politically sensitive, and practically difficult, question of boundaries, the ministry will be better placed to go ahead with pilot amalgamations. This matter was under consideration by cabinet at the time of the mission.

From our visits to the rural areas and our analysis of interview data, it seems to us that amalgamation will be a slow and difficult process, with the speed of implementation varying considerably in different parts of the country. It also seems clear that while the amalgamation process will have an immediate short term effect, in that it will remove an undesirable political anachronism, its impact on the material well-being of the mass of people in the (present) District Councils will be minimal in the short and medium terms. It seems therefore that while the amalgamation is a desirable and necessary development, there are important and urgent needs in the District Councils which will not be addressed by this process. We realize that direct financial assistance to the local authorities does not strictly fall within the bounds of public sector support but believe that support to the administrative system should be seen in a broader perspectives.

3.3.5. Recommendations

We understand that the Government considers that the ministry in general and the amalgamation process in particular would benefit from the continued presence of SALA. SALA has a wealth of experience and expertise to draw upon which will prove invaluable to MLGRUD in the difficult times which lie ahead. We concur with this view.

This sub-programme should therefore continue to receive support from SIDA. We recommend that:

- a) A review should be conducted at a time considered opportune by the Ministry, SALA and SIDA which should pay particular attention to developments in the amalgamation

process, and tailor future assistance in a way which optimises SALA's contribution to that process.

b) In the meantime support should include: further study of the organizational and managerial requirements of amalgamation advisory services in the development of administrative systems for the amalgamated councils training of a new cadre of trainers (in the ministry headquarters and the provinces) to replace those lost to the Ministry of Political Affairs

c) Consideration be given to supporting the production of a master plan governing rural development as a whole, thereby placing the amalgamation process within this broader context. Such a study should, however, be coordinated with other potential donors.

3.4 Department of Physical Planning

3.4.1. Background

This project was initiated by a request from the Department of Physical Planning (DPP) made to SIDA in May 1986. In response to this request, SIDA mounted an appraisal mission which visited Zimbabwe in November 1986. The appraisal team recommended support in two areas:

- the facilitation of operational decentralization to the district level; and
- institution building for DPP itself.

3.4.2. Objectives

We have not found any specific objectives in the Terms of Reference. In a general sense the objectives appear to focus on the need to enhance the work of DPP, by providing the resources to expand its activities and to strengthen its capacity to meet the demands of the unit.

3.4.3. Project Organization

Originally the project was designed to be implemented without any resident adviser. Six main components constituted the project: short term consultancies, scholarships abroad, in-house training, study tours, equipment, expenditure funds and backstopping and project coordination. Swedeplan was selected as the consultant agency because of its expertise in physical planning. Eventually it became clear that project coordination and administration were too cumbersome to be undertaken by telephone between Swedeplan and the local staff of the DPP and in May 1989 it was decided that a long term consultant would be appointed to facilitate coordination and the dialogue with the DPP. An expatriate staff member, originally financed under a topping up scheme was selected to fill this position.

3.4.4. Assessment

The project has recently been the subject of an in-depth evaluation. The main finding of the evaluation was that some components have been of great use to DPP, notably the equipment, the scholarships, the conferences and some study tours. On the other hand it would appear as if the transfer of skills has been limited and that the scale of the project bore little relationships to the needs of the organization.

We agree with the Evaluation Mission and particularly endorse the following explanations for the shortcomings:

- "The scale of the programme budget underestimated the need of involvement from Swedeplan in the management of DPP projects." This may have served to limit the dialogue between DPP and Swedeplan.
- "Resources were spread too thinly".
- "The project document spelt out quantitative targets for each component and they were taken too literally as ends in themselves rather than as a means to meet the overall objectives of the programme."

We find that this project was not well conceived. In particular, insufficient attention was paid to formulating clear objectives for institution building. In addition, while the DPP clearly appreciates the material support provided by SIDA, they have little praise for Swedeplan's contribution and, in areas other than those of design and architecture, question that organization's professional competence.

An example of the extreme focus on operational expediency as opposed to long term transfer of skills is the appointment of the long term adviser. The individual selected is an appreciated former staff member of the DPP and as such an important contributor to the operations of DPP. His appointment has thus, in all likelihood, reduced the administrative burdens of coordinating the assistance programme. On the other hand he is not familiar with Swedeplan and can therefore not be expected to strengthen the institutional ties between DPP and Swedeplan or enhance the institutional dialogue.

3.4.5 Conclusions and recommendations

Our overriding conclusion is that this is a project which has been useful to the DPP only in that it has removed some obstacles to the operations of the Department. The project has, however, done little to systematically enhance the skills of the department. Beyond these general statements, the vagueness and lack of the overall and long-term objectives constitute an obstacle to more stringent assessment of the results.

It is, however, clear to us that the DPP at present has an important role to play in helping the government to realize the goals of its economic restructuring and public service reform programmes. We believe that this more than justifies continued Swedish support to the DPP for the next three year period.

3.4.6 Recommendations

We are not in a position to make specific recommendations as to the nature of the future programme. We believe that the DPP should be asked to identify a clear and specific role for the Swedish support. This role should be broader than the mere provision of further funds and equipment and should be put in the perspective of other changes in the public sector, earlier mentioned. It should include an institutional component with a clear development objective and monitorable sub-components. A project identification mission is probably necessary to help the Department, and the Ministry, to formulate a request. We recommend that the question of consultant agency be solved only when the nature of the next project has been determined.

3.5 The Office of the Comptroller and Auditor General

3.5.1. Background

While a formal agreement exists between the Swedish National Audit Bureau (RRV) and the Zimbabwean Office of the Comptroller and Auditor General (CAG), the delivery of assistance has not yet begun. An RRV long term adviser is scheduled to arrive in Harare in January 1991.

The foundations for this project were laid in discussions and correspondence between the auditor generals of Sweden and Zimbabwe.

The terms of reference state that the project is to be included in the next cooperation agreement between Sweden and Zimbabwe in the field of public administration.

3.5.2. Objectives

The overall aims of this sub-programme of support are to develop CAG's ability to conduct value-for-money auditing, and to maintain and enhance its capacity to cope with annual demands for financial auditing. The terms of reference also incorporate a broadly stated institution building objective. These aims are to be achieved through personnel training and the development of new work methods.

3.5.3. Project Organization

Resources have been earmarked for, among other things, a long term adviser, short term consultants, study tours and equipment.

3.5.4. Assessment

In our view, CAG personnel already possess high levels of knowledge and skill in the field of financial auditing. CAG also has the potential now to develop strength and expertise in value-for-money auditing. Indeed, CAG is not without experience in this field, although it has never had a specialized work unit dedicated to it. A limited amount of



The second phase of support to the Department of Taxes focuses on updating and computerizing of the tax collection system.
Photo: Gustaf Eneroth, SIDA Photo Archiver.

foreign assistance has been received in this area in the past. CAG has a clear strategic plan for developing its capability in both auditing fields, and has developed criteria for measuring progress towards clearly identified goals.

This raises some doubts about the strength of the need for a long term adviser. However, since this has already been decided, we would strongly recommend that his or her role should focus on skill transfer and institution building rather than project administration and coordination.

Another issue concerns the staffing of the performance audit unit. At present the CAG allocates 3 positions to performance auditing and 256 to financial auditing. CAG recognizes that a staff of 3 is inadequate and plans to increase the size of the value-for-money auditing unit from 3 to 20 positions over the next five years.

CAG's plans for the future, and the decentralization of financial decision making power, have major implications for activities which at present consume substantial resources in particular, the detailed verifications of state budget votes which are carried out each year are time and labor intensive. Proposed reforms, aimed at further decentralization and delegation of financial autonomy, suggest that CAG tasks may evolve and call for different staff configurations, since these developments decrease the need for detailed financial auditing.

3.5.5. Recommendations

At this point, the overall nature and purpose of this sub-programme is not defined in a way which indicates clearly how the organization might adapt to the changing circumstances it will face in the future as a result of impending economic and administrative reforms in Zimbabwe. In order to assist in this, we recommend that the project objectives be reviewed and tailored to the anticipated changes in the Zimbabwean public sector. Such strategic discussions should take place immediately and before project implementation starts. The outcome of these discussions should define the priorities and could mean changes in present allocations of project resources.

3.6 Department of Taxes

3.6.1. Background

Cooperation with the Department of Taxes began in 1988. In the first phase of cooperation, the Department of Taxes was assisted with the updating and restructuring of its income tax assessment system. The second phase focused on updating and computerizing the tax collection system.

3.6.2. Objectives

The long term objectives of the assistance (terms of reference, September 1988) are to help "improve the efficiency of the Department of Taxes...i.e. to improve the utilization of resources and the use of the information collected, by means of modern methods and methodology. To achieve this the project will focus on administrative development, technology transfer and the development of relevant competence..." It is estimated that it will take more than five years to achieve these objectives.

The terms of reference also list two short term objectives:

- the upgrading and modernization of the tax collection system; and
- the strengthening of the management capability of the Department of Taxes through formal and on-the-job training.

3.6.3. Project Organization

The project revolves around a long term adviser whose tasks include: advising the Commissioner of Taxes, the training of staff, project monitoring, and the coordination of external assistance. In addition, the sub-programme involves the provision of short term consultancy services, classroom training, study tours and equipment.

3.6.4. Assessment

Apart from problems arising from delays experienced in the procurement of equipment caused we think by confusion regarding who was to finance purchases this sub-programme functions extremely well.

The two agencies involved have developed a well thought through common view on the immediate future of the project. Its success to this point has been a function partly of the effective working group consisting of the long term adviser and departmental representatives established to monitor and facilitate operations. Another contributing factor has been the existence of clearly formulated terms of reference which incorporate medium and long term objectives and their interrelationships.

3.6.5. Conclusion

Our conclusion is that the project should continue in its present form for at least the next three year period. However, we believe that cooperation should be extended beyond technical issues, such as tax collection, to administrative policy issues. Other possibilities would include assisting the department to integrate its activities with the work of the Ministry of Finance.

These issues should be discussed and considered in connection with the three year agreement which follows the present one, and goals connected with them should be included among the long-term objectives of that phase of the sub-programme's development.

3.7 Central Statistics Office

3.7.1. Background

Cooperation between Zimbabwe and Sweden in the area of statistics and economic planning began in 1983. Initially, cooperation focussed on the general strengthening of the Central Statistics Office (CSO), and covered such areas as survey capability, computing, and the setting up of a printing office. In recent years, the focus has shifted towards the identification of statistical subject matters and, most recently, towards user education.

3.7.2. Objectives

The objectives of the programme (terms of reference, June 1990) include:

- the general strengthening of CSO, including its long term planning capability; the development of user related services, and EDP training;
- the provision of technical assistance to the development of social indicators in health and education, crime, labor, transport, energy, and statistics; and
- the provision of expert advice on census organization, publicity, cartography, and so on.

3.7.3. Project Organization

A long term consultant is responsible for coordinating inputs from Statistics Sweden,



Gathering and interpreting information is necessary to study the effects of the macro-economic reforms. Thus, this sub-programme is highly relevant. Clear long-term objectives is one reason for its success.

Photo: Gustaf Eneroth, Bazaar Photo Archives.

and for providing technical advice in his area of expertise. He also constitutes a link between CSO and Statistics Sweden, and supports the institution building role of the director of CSO.

The sub-programme also involves short term consultancies, study tours to Sweden and other countries, and conference attendance.

A coordinating committee comprising a project coordinator, the long term advisers, and the director of the 1992 census has been established.

In Stockholm, Statistics Sweden has an effective specialized unit for managing its overseas ventures.

3.7.4. Assessment

This sub-programme provides clear and compelling evidence of the benefits to be derived from providing assistance through well planned and well managed forms of institutional cooperation. The following features of this sub-programme are particularly noteworthy:

- clear long term objectives exist, as do well conceived ideas about the components of the assistance and the ways in which these contribute to the attainment of long term goals;

- there is a rational blend of long term consultancies, short term consultancies and study tours (and equipment);
- smooth working relationships exist between nationals and expatriates;
- there are high levels of mutual understanding, respect and trust which result partly from the close similarities between the two organizations, the relative "concreteness" of their technical operations, and shared values regarding the importance of user "friendly" statistics;
- a well functioning coordinating committee has been established.

This sub-programme also demonstrates the benefits which *can* arise from having in place long term advisers who possess a sound knowledge and understanding of the Swedish counterpart organization, its strengths and weaknesses, and modes of operation.

Overall, the sub-programme has contributed significantly to CSO's development as an organization, that is, to its effectiveness, and its culture or ethos. These positive features of the organization have helped to keep at relatively low levels turnover among senior management and other key personnel at CSO.

3.7.5. Conclusions and Recommendations

This sub-programme is clearly of considerable relevance and benefit to the development efforts of Zimbabwe; it will become more so as the demands of the sweeping economic and administrative reforms which lie ahead become apparent.

Nevertheless, it is likely soon to be the case that CSO will be able to cope with these demands unaided. There is general consensus among all the parties involved that a phased withdrawal of Swedish support is warranted. In our view, this should be a gradual process, designed to minimize disruption and the possibility of increased staff turnover. We therefore recommend that the phasing out process extend over the next three year planning period.

Subsequently, we recommend that *ad hoc* assistance be continued for special projects; an example being the 1992 census. We see some merit in this being treated from the beginning as a special project which falls outside of the "normal" assistance provided in the present sub-programme. This would enable support for this project to continue uninterrupted by the phasing out process.

3.8 Ministry of Community and Cooperative Development

3.8.1. Background

Swedish assistance to the Ministry of Community and Cooperative Development (MCCD) began in 1987 with the appointment of a SIPU consultant — after an approach to SIDA made by MPS on behalf of MCCD. Since that time an impressive programme

of training for VCWs has been conducted, a publication programme has been successfully launched, training materials have been developed, and a pilot programme aimed at FCWs has been initiated. The results of a major questionnaire survey based evaluation of the VCW training programme are currently being analyzed, and should be available by February-March 1991.

3.8.2. Objectives

No terms of reference exist for this sub-programme.

3.8.3. Project Organization

In this case, project organization rests primarily in the sound working relationship established between a single SIPU appointed consultant and relevant steering groups in MCCD. This individual is also the major channel for the provision of assistance which, to date, has mostly taken the forms mentioned above.

One meeting per year takes place in Harare between the SIPU (Stockholm) coordinator and representatives of MCCD.

3.8.4. Assessment

As with other ministries in the Zimbabwean public sector, the general thrust of the report of the PSRC towards a more responsive and effective public service has numerous implications for MCCD. In these and other respects, however, the team formed the impression that MCCD already displayed in its operations a number of the desirable qualities set out in the PSRC report, and seemed well placed to develop further along these lines at a reasonable pace.

With regard to the sub-programme's compatibility with SIDA's guidelines for cooperation in the field of public administration, it clearly satisfies a number of criteria. In particular, the sub-programme has a clear impact on accessibility, accountability, devolution, efficiency and effectiveness. Moreover, the training programmes supported to date are appropriately contextualised, relevant, problem-oriented, adult learner centered, impact directly on basic needs, involve appropriate trainees and have been subjected to satisfactory follow-up procedures.

We consider the strategic direction adopted by MCCD to be broadly consistent with desirable trends in the public service as a whole. The mere existence of a self-generated well articulated and widely appreciated strategy is itself an important indicator of a proactive, change oriented, responsive organizational culture. The substance of MCCD strategy, which is concerned with improving the condition of some of the most seriously and chronically underprivileged members of Zimbabwean society, adds further weight to this view.

However, while there would appear to be high levels of strategic awareness and commitment among key groups at MCCD, we are somewhat concerned about the absence of any terms of reference governing its association with SIPU, and the lack of

precisely formulated objectives for some individual projects within the sub-programme. This complicates evaluation and project management and, at worst, could lead to any positive change being considered after the fact as a sign of project success. We believe that the existence of clearly specified objectives and terms of reference will help to ensure that a well trained and well equipped administrative structure will positively affect the lives of the people whose interests it is there to serve. In the absence of such objectives, there is increased risk that a sleek administration may become an end in itself and that the underprivileged will again have to make do with "trickle down".

On the question of the recent evaluation conducted by MCCD in relation to its VCW training programme, the results of this survey were still unavailable at the time of writing. However, from our discussions with MCCD staff, our visits to the rural areas, and feedback from other institutions (e.g., ZIPAM), it is clear that the programme has been well received, and to that extent can be judged a success.

We were persuaded also that the evaluation methodology adopted was appropriate, provided reasonable safeguards against "insider trading", and addressed concrete matters of substance (i.e. how had peoples lives been affected?), as well as attitudes.

An important overall impression reached by the team was that there appear to be reasonable levels of strategic awareness, planning capability, and commitment among the relevant groups in MCCD. This has helped to ensure that the assistance provided by SIDA has been put to good use.

3.8.5. Conclusions and Recommendations

A number of possible avenues of continued cooperation and assistance became apparent during the course of our investigation. We feel that these would best be read in conjunction with the MCCD draft proposal entitled "SIDA Public Sector Support Programme 1990-1993". In addition, recommendations concerning project organization are made. We recommend that:

- a) The present form of project organization should be continued, but that more attention should be given to objective setting during project formulation and throughout the project life cycle.
- b) Support to the FCW programme should be continued. In the pilot phase, this would entail assistance with programme design and delivery, and equipment (We consider the need for equipment and scarce materials e.g., cement, fencing wire, sewing machines, portable toilets etc. to be an important facet of this project. While we realize that such items would not normally qualify for funding in this sector, we wish nevertheless to recommend that they be seriously considered for support as they are so central to the basic need satisfaction goals of this project). This would need to be followed by thorough evaluation in order to determine effective strategies for diffusion. There is the opportunity now to design a well controlled evaluation study for this programme.
- c) Support should be continued to the Community Publishing Programme, and should

be taken to include the development and diffusion of the present publishing initiative and the "local book project".

d) Consideration should be given to supporting the development of management capability at middle and higher levels in the organization in order to help ensure that advances made by existing lower-level programmes are sustained, and allowed to operate effectively.

e) Consideration should be given to supporting a number of specific areas of training, such as community and cooperative development programmes, the strengthening of the VIDCOs' role in community development, and training for WCCs.

f) In the near future strategic discussions should be held which involve the SIPU (Stockholm) coordinator, an external consultant appointed by SIDA, and senior representatives of MCCD in order to determine the precise extent and nature of Swedish assistance, and to set priorities and target dates for the next three years.

In all of the above we have resisted the temptation to be drawn down into the detail of what these broad initiatives might entail as the time at our disposal has clearly been insufficient for us to make valid judgments at that level. In the case of MCCD, however, we reiterate our faith in the organization's capability to think through the details and to present them in coherent packages. Nevertheless, as indicated earlier, we see it as necessary that the project develops a more structured approach to project design and management. This should help to coordinate SIDA's contributions, to channel expert assistance to agreed areas of greatest need, and to encourage in SIDA/SIPU and MCCD the maintenance of the strategic awareness which has been such a major part of this sub-programme's success to date.

In sum, the team is persuaded of the relevance and importance of the sub-programme and the relative maturity of those parts of the organization (MCCD) whose responsibility it is to develop and sustain it. We therefore find that this sub-programme deserves continued support from SIDA, but that projects within the sub-programme, and the sub-programme as a whole, should be governed by clearly specified objectives and terms of reference.

Chapter 4

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUTURE SECTOR SUPPORT

4.1 Assessment of Present Sector Support

It is clear from the preceding chapter that all of the sub-programmes which constitute Sweden's support to the public administration sector in Zimbabwe are worthwhile, and most are broadly in accord with SIDA guidelines. Institution building is the cornerstone of these guidelines, and in those sub-programmes which have strayed from the guidelines it is in this fundamental area that they have done so. In our view, the primary reasons for this are associated with a general lack of strategic awareness and planning, and less than satisfactory management of the sub-programmes. For these and other reasons institutional cooperation has not always worked as well as it should. There have also been wide variations of interpretation of the meaning of institution building, with too much emphasis being placed on the routinized delivery of training courses, and too little, or none at all, on other aspects such as organizational structure and design, culture building, and leadership development. Many of our recommendations for change are aimed at rectifying deficiencies in these areas, or improving current practice.

All of the sub-programmes potentially have important parts to play in the implementation of the economic and administrative reforms which lie ahead. We have therefore recommended that support be continued to all eight of the sub-programmes.

Our report contains a number of general implications for institutional cooperation and the formulation and management of projects. The next two sections present our analysis and recommendations on these topics. The final section of the report considers possible areas of future support, including women, financial management, and the administrative reform implementation unit.

4.2 Institutional Cooperation

According to SIDA guidelines, institutional cooperation is the preferred means for assistance delivery. We have seen in Chapter 3 that such institutional cooperation can take a wide variety of forms. The major axes along which variation occurs are:

- the similarity of the two institutions;
- the "concreteness" of their operations;
- the amount of attention given to institution building, and evidence of reasonable understanding of what it should constitute; and
- the extent and nature of strategic planning and follow-up, and the existence of clearly specified terms of reference and objectives.

Institutional cooperation *per se* appears to work best when: the two institutions are similar; their operations are relatively "concrete"; they give considerable attention to, and have a shared and valid understanding of institution building.

This should not be taken to mean that assistance cannot be delivered successfully in ways which do not conform closely to the cooperation model; the clearest example of this being the case of MCCD, where considerable success has been achieved with little or no direct input from the Swedish partner organization (SIPU).

The *key issue* in our judgment is, however, the quality of the strategic design and management of the cooperation, which includes continual monitoring, appraisal and revision involving the senior management of the cooperating bodies.

4.3 The Project Cycle

The project cycle consists of: identification, formulation, implementation, monitoring, and evaluation. Below we consider the implications of our findings for these stages of the project cycle, except evaluation.

4.3.1. Project Formulation

Many of the problems observed in this study are attributable to weak project formulation. Areas of weakness have included problem identification and analysis, strategic planning and objective setting, and institutional and individual role analysis and definition. We would therefore recommend that future projects pay particular attention to:

- clear problem identification to ascertain that the real obstacles in the project are mutually understood and recognized.
- strategic planning as an ongoing process which results in the production, and continual updating, of a written strategic plan. This could form the basis of a project document outlining the nature of the assistance, medium and short term goals, and methods of management and control.
- defining clearly the roles and expectations of the respective institutions, and of key individuals (e.g., long term advisers) within them, so as to make certain that the long term objectives are mutually understood.

We have detected a tendency by SIDA to accept project proposals, which have been prepared by potential consultant agencies, somewhat uncritically. We would therefore

recommend that the above principles be adhered to regardless of the origin of the project proposal.

4.3.2. Project Organization and Implementation

Where sub-programmes are intended to conform reasonably closely to the institutional cooperation model, a number of general inferences regarding project organization and management can be drawn from our findings.

- Where long term resident advisers are considered necessary or desirable (e.g., most forms of institutional cooperation), all other things being equal they should have sufficient knowledge of the Swedish (or other) counterpart organization to enable them to make informed judgments about its ability to deliver different forms of assistance, and to act as an effective communication channel. Such a background cannot, of course, compensate for lack of other necessary features such as professional competence and managerial and interpersonal skills. In specific projects, where the similarities between the cooperating institutions are limited, the relevance of having detailed knowledge of the international counterpart is relatively small.
- Coordinating or steering committees with clearly defined powers and responsibilities will in many cases need to be put in place at the strategic, managerial, and operational levels. At the strategic level, senior management representatives from both partner organizations should be involved.

4.3.3. Project Monitoring and Evaluation

We have discussed in Chapter 3 the extent to which a number of the sub-programmes diverged from their own objectives (where these were stated) and, in some cases, from SIDA guidelines. Inadequate project monitoring was a contributory factor in most of these cases. The way in which projects are monitored should vary according to the circumstances faced, but whatever form such monitoring takes it should aim to ensure that operational and medium term goal attainment contributes to strategic goals and, in particular, to institution building.

Annual reviews, and other forms of external evaluation, can play a useful part in this process, so long as they are not seen as a substitute for it. In cases where they have been relied upon exclusively, they have sometimes failed to detect serious anomalies, and as a result sub-programmes have been allowed to proceed in less than optimal directions for long periods. Whilst not a guarantee against such occurrences, a top management which is seen to be taking a direct interest in operational involvement can significantly reduce their likelihood.

There are implications here for SIDA itself. We feel that SIDA should develop its own ability to make judgments about project formulation and monitoring. One possibility would be to relieve regional desk officers at SIDA headquarters of a certain amount of routine day-to-day work in order to create space for closer project contact throughout

the project cycle. Another possibility would be to delegate such work to carefully selected external consultants, and to budget for this – say, in terms of person days per year according to the size and complexity of the project. A third strategy would be to tighten-up the procedures for annual review, and to be more critical and demanding of the reviews produced by Swedish counterpart organizations. For example, in the latter regard, more could be required in terms of problem identification and proposed solutions, progress reports towards agreed objectives, the modification of such objectives and the addition of new objectives, that is, a report which is a useful guide to action and a basis for decision making rather than a simple recitation of courses delivered and short term consultancies conducted.

4.4 Possible Areas of Future Cooperation

The economic and administrative reform programmes upon which Zimbabwe has embarked may well create a wide range of new demands and needs for assistance. Accordingly, and notwithstanding SIDA's wish to rationalize and streamline its assistance to the public sector in Zimbabwe, we identify below a number of broad areas of possible future assistance.

4.4.1 Financial Management

The decentralization of financial decision-making power is an important theme of the PSRC report. It is also clear that strengthened, or reformed, financial and fiscal management will be an element of any full scale structural adjustment programme. Sweden's recent experience of the same reform processes could be of considerable interest to Zimbabwe.

4.4.2 Women in the Public Service

There is a general awareness of gender issues in the public service, and the advancement of women in Zimbabwean society attracts presidential support. This means that conditions in the public service are receptive to affirmative action initiatives. Indeed, steps in this direction have already been taken, and the MPS is actively considering a range of possibilities in such areas as training, placement, recruitment and selection. Much remains to be done however. For example, in the area of training, consideration should be given to the possibility of transferring to Zimbabwe suitably adapted Swedish courses which aim to modify values and attitudes towards women managers. More attention could also be paid to ensuring that Swedish consultants are sensitive to gender issues, and well informed about them. We would also like to see gender issues made an explicit part of project formulation, strategic planning, and monitoring, particularly in institutions such as ZIPAM and MPS. Finally, in the case of MCCD issues of gender, management and development coincide in a way which provides a compelling logic for the maintenance and possible expansion of SIDA support to that sub-programme.

4.4.3 The Labor Market

Our brief discussions with the Ministry of Labor, Manpower Planning and Social Welfare confirm that Swedish experience could be relevant to the reforms now being prepared by the ministry. However, in line with our earlier recommendations, careful project identification and formulation needs to be undertaken first. Even so, it seems to us that Swedish employment policies may be of less relevance to Zimbabwe than, say, Swedish experience and knowledge regarding collective bargaining institutions, policies and practices (the subject of recent debate in Zimbabwe), labor policies such as grievance procedures, and other aspects of industrial relations.

4.4.4 The Administrative Reform Implementation Unit

The government of Zimbabwe has established an implementation unit charged with initiating and overseeing those reforms arising out of the report of the PSRC which have been approved by parliament. This is a welcome confirmation of the government's determination to bring about positive change in the public service. It is our view that the unit could play an important role in the modernization of the Public Sector in Zimbabwe.

SIDA has already allocated resources to support the PSRC Implementation Unit during 1990/91. We recommend that this unit receives continued support from SIDA. Initially, this support might take the form of training in project planning and management, the management of change, consultancy and basic computer skills, and possibly the provision of equipment (computers). Once again, however, it may be the case that a short project identification mission should be mounted in order to make proposals regarding the detail and timing of any assistance given.

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

CAG:	Comptroller and Auditor General
CSO:	Central Statistics Office
DPP:	Department of Physical Planning
FCW:	Farm Community Workers
IU:	Implementation Unit
MCCD:	Ministry of Community and Cooperative Development
MDP:	Management Development Programme
MLGRUD:	Ministry of Local Government, Rural and Urban Development
MPS:	Ministry of the Public Service
PSRC:	Public Service Review Commission
RDC:	Rural and District Councils
RRV:	Swedish National Audit Bureau
SALA:	Swedish Association of Local Authorities
SIDA:	Swedish International Development Authority
SIPU:	National Institute for Civil Service Training and Development
TMB:	Training Management Bureau
VCW:	Village Community Workers
VIDCO:	Village Development Committee
WCC:	Ward Community Coordinator
ZIPAM:	Zimbabwe Institute of Public Administration
ZPS:	Zimbabwean Public Service

TERMS OF REFERENCE

General Background

Zimbabwe and Sweden have been co-operating within the public administration sector since 1982. Originally the programme was included in the Education Sector Support. The first separate Agreement on Public Administration Sector Support was signed in 1982. The present Agreement covers the period 1987-88 - 1989-90 and will be extended until June 30, 1991.

The main objectives of the support as spelt out in the Specific Agreement are:

- to improve the efficiency of the public sector at all levels in order to create a better foundation for economic growth and for the utilization of internal as well as external resources;
- to increase the participation of the rural population in the decision-making process through the development of local government structures and through training;
- to contribute to an even distribution of economic and social resources among the people.

During the 1980's the sector support grew and the programme will comprise the following components as from July 1, 1990:

- public service training and development (via the Ministry of the Public Service, the Public Service Commission and the Zimbabwe Institute of Public Administration and Management (ZIPAM));
- the development and strengthening of local government structures and capacity-building for physical planning via the Ministry of Local Government, Rural and Urban Development (MLGRUD);
- capacity-building in statistics and economic planning (via the Central Statistical Office of the Ministry of Finance, Economic Planning and Development (MFEPD));
- the strengthening of the tax administration system (via the Department of Taxes, MFEPD);
- capacity-building in value-for-money auditing and the strengthening of financial auditing (via the Office of the Comptroller and Auditor-General, MFEPD);
- the training of extension staff at the village and ward level and support to workers on commercial farms (via the Ministry of Community and Co-operative Development (MCCD)).

On the Zimbabwean side, the Ministry of the Public Service coordinates the Swedish support to the Public Administration Sector.

Preparations for a new long-term agreement on Swedish support to the Public Administration Sector will start in October, 1990. It has been suggested that a joint sector study be carried out in order to provide a basis for continued co-operation in the 1990's.

Development of the Public Administration Sector Support

Since Independence the public sector in Zimbabwe has assumed increasing responsibilities, especially in relation to the provision of social services to the public. As a consequence the sector has grown considerably.

The Swedish assistance to the sector started off addressing general training needs in the civil service by contributing to the establishment of a training infrastructure, the development of curricula and training material and the training of trainers. System development activities, related for example to personnel administration and staff development, were also included on a limited scale.

From the start a minor programme for the training of local government officials was also included. Over time this developed into a comprehensive programme aimed at strengthening local government structures and preparing for the planned amalgamation of Rural and District Councils, thereby enhancing decentralization measures. Both training and system development work were financed. At a later stage a limited project to improve the capacity for physical planning at provincial level was introduced.

Support was also provided to the Ministry of Finance, Economic Planning and Development (Central Statistical Office) for capacity-building in statistics and econometrics in order to create a better base for economic planning and development. This was particularly important in relation to the rural areas, as hardly any statistics were available on which to base development planning for the communal areas.

When the Government of Zimbabwe decided to set up a Commission of Inquiry on Taxation in 1984, SIDA agreed to support the work of the Commission. The assistance was eventually prolonged and geared towards improvement and modernization of tax administration so as to create a system that was better equipped to handle the changes proposed by the Commission.

After some time a programme for the training of extension workers at the village and ward level in co-operation with what is now the Ministry of Community and Co-operative Development was introduced with the objective of improving living conditions in the rural areas and the participation of the rural population in planning and decision-making.

The programmes related to statistics and auditing (the latter starting on July 1, 1990) are intended to provide tools for policy analysis, development planning, financial management and financial accountability.

SIDA agreed in 1987 to support the work of the Public Service Review Commission (PSRC). The report prepared by the Commission and published in 1989 presented far-reaching proposals for change aimed at the creation of a leaner, better disciplined, better trained and more motivated public service. The implementation of these proposals will start in 1990-91 and it can be foreseen that the structure of the Swedish Public Administration Sector Support in the 1990's will be affected as a result. A request from the Zimbabwean Government for Swedish support to this reform work has already been received and a decision has been taken to include this in the Sector Support as of July 1, 1990.

The support to the public administration sector has been organized mainly in the form of institutional co-operation or twinning between organizations/institutions with similar responsibilities in Zimbabwe and Sweden. It is felt that this is an efficient and flexible way of structuring

assistance. The idea behind this model is to encourage professional co-operation between colleagues, thus creating conditions for the transfer of "corporate skills" and for institution-building. The method of work chosen has usually been process-oriented and training programmes have been based on participation and action research whenever possible.

Overall Objectives of the Study

The study shall analyse the relevance of the present composition of the Public Administration Sector Support in relation to

- the recommendations put forward by the Public Service Review Commission as adopted by the Government of Zimbabwe,
- SIDA's policy guidelines for co-operation in the field of public administration, and
- current trends in the public sector as identified by the study team.

The study shall also provide the Zimbabwean ministries and SIDA with information on the strengths and weaknesses of present institutional co-operation/twinning arrangements, including methods for transfer of knowledge, and give recommendations as to future implementation methods.

A proposal for continued sector support based on identified needs shall be presented. Where necessary, recommendations as to a change in the composition of this support shall be made.

Specific Tasks of the Study

Overall Issues

The possibilities of increasing women's participation in public sector development shall be studied in order to suggest new avenues for promoting women's role in society.

Various Sub-Programmes

The various sub-programmes shall be briefly reviewed. For each sub-programme, specific recommendations shall be presented and the consequences of the general conclusions shall be drawn. In addition, the following specific issues shall be addressed by the study team:

Ministry of the Public Service

Steps taken by the Ministry of the Public Service to implement the recommendations of the Public Service Review Commission as to personnel management, in-service training and organization and methods (O&M) work shall be reviewed.

Ministry of Local Government, Rural and Urban Development

A prognosis shall be made as to the expected amalgamation of Rural and District Councils. If further substantial delays are foreseen, the study team should identify those parts of the present programme that are independent of the amalgamation process and make recommendations as to which activities should receive continued support.

In this context the findings and recommendations of two recent reports, "Evaluation of the Swedish Support to Local Government Development in Zimbabwe", April 1990, and "A study of Training Needs in the Local Government Sector", February 1990, as well as a minor study of the support to the Department of Physical Planning, to be undertaken in September 1990, shall be taken into consideration.

Ministry of Finance, Economic Planning and Development/Central Statistical Office (CSO)

It has been planned that the Swedish support to CSO will be successively phased out during the next long-term agreement period. The possible effects of this phasing-out should be analyzed by the study team and, if necessary, recommendations for SIDA action shall be made.

Ministry of Finance, Economic Planning and Development/Office of the Comptroller and Auditor-General

Efforts shall be made within this new sub-programme to strike a balance between support to more traditional financial audit and to the introduction of value-for-money auditing. Recommendations shall be presented by the study team regarding support during the new long-term agreement period.

Ministry of Community and Co-operative Development

The study team shall analyse the results of the the evaluation report conducted by the Ministry in 1990 and give their opinion on the findings and recommendations.

Ministry of Finance, Economic Planning and Development/Central Computing Services

The Central Computing Services (CCS) will receive support for consultancy services during 1990 from the Swedish Personnel and Consultancy Fund. The study team shall analyze and report on the effects of the present short-comings in the CCS on sub-programmes included in the Public Administration Sector Support. The team shall consider the reports written by the Swedish Institute for Civil Service Training and Management (SIPU) and MPS, "Computerization of the Public Service", I and II, 1986.

Composition of the Study Team

The study team will consist of professionals with extensive experience from development work in the public sector. Some of the participants will be selected by SIDA and some by the Zimbabwean authorities.

Time Schedule

The joint study team shall meet in Harare for preparatory discussions (approximately 1 week) about 6-8 weeks before the actual work is supposed to start.

The main study will require a 4-6 weeks stay in Zimbabwe and about 2 weeks of preparatory work and report-writing in the consultants' home country. It is essential that the study team also visit areas in Zimbabwe outside Harare.

The work in Zimbabwe will most likely take place during October-November, 1990, and the preparatory discussions in Harare in August-September.

Reporting

The study team shall produce a draft report while in Harare. The findings shall be presented to and discussed at the Ministry of the Public Service, the SIDA office in Harare and SIDA in Stockholm. The final report shall be submitted to the Zimbabwean authorities and SIDA before December 15, 1990.

SIDA EVALUATION REPORT SERIES

- 1987/1 **EXTENSIVE RURAL DEVELOPMENT**
An Evaluation of the Zone I Programme in Guinea-Bissau
by Jan Olsson, Lars Smedman, Göran Widerström
- 1987/2 **FOREIGN EXCHANGE ZAMBIA**
An Evaluation of the Auction System in the Zambian Economy
by Rudolf Jaksas
- 1987/3 **DROUGHT AND DESTABILIZATION**
An Evaluation of Swedish Disaster Relief in Mozambique 1983 to 1985
by Tom Alberts and Kristel Edwards
- 1987/4 **HEALTH CENTRES-IN NEED OF TREATMENT**
A Joint Evaluation of Sweden's Support to Health Sector Development in Tanzania 1972-1978
by Lillemor Andersson-Brolin, Frants Staugård
- 1987/5 **TRAINING FOR PUBLIC SERVICE**
An Evaluation of Sweden's Co-operation with Zimbabwe in Public Service Training 1982-1986
by Astrid Dufborg, Merrick Jones, Elisabeth Lewin
- 1987/6 **LOOKING BOTH WAYS**
Swaziland between South Africa and SADC
An Evaluation of Sweden's development co-operation with Swaziland
by Samuel Falle, Karlis Goppers and Lars Johansson
- 1987/7 **PAPER, TIMBER AND MINORITIES**
An Evaluation of Sweden's support to Forest Industry in Bangladesh by Karlis Goppers, Hans Nordin and Jan Valdein
- 1987/8 **FORESTRY FOR THE POOR**
An evaluation of the SIDA supported Social Forestry Project in Tamil Nadu, India
by Mike Arnold, Axel Bergman, Göran Djurfeldt
- 1988/1 **MIGRANTS BY NECESSITY**
A report on the living conditions of forestry workers in the SIDA supported Bai Bang Programme
- 1988/2 **SISTERHOOD ON TRIAL**
An evaluation of the performance and linkages of the sister industries in Tanzania
by Jerker Carlsson, Sverker Alänge, Kim Forss, Serve Malai, Sari Scheinberg
- 1988/3 **IMPROVE YOUR BUSINESS**
An Evaluation of a ILO/SIDA Regional small scale business promotion Project in Africa
by Claes Lindahl and Rob Galloway
- 1989/1 **THE KOTMALE ENVIRONMENT**
A study of the environmental impact of the Kotmale Hydropower Project in Sri Lanka
by Dick Johansson
- 1989/2 **FISH FARMING FOR RURAL DEVELOPMENT**
An Evaluation of SIDA/FAO supported aquaculture in southern Africa
by Karlis Goppers and Jim Miller
- 1989/3 **NO SHORT CUTS TO HEALTH**
An evaluation of SIDA health sector support to Zambia 1979-1988 by S. Dahlgren, V. Diwan, K. Edwards, A. Gunnarsson, L.-K.J. Mwansa, R.S. Patel, O.S. Seasa, T.K. Sinyangwe
- 1989/4 **FROM COMPETITION TO CO-OPERATION?**
An Evaluation of MEIDA and its impact on the engineering industries in Tanzania by Jerker Carlsson, Kim Forss and Serve Malai
- 1990/1 **CONCERN AND RESPONSIBILITY**
An Evaluation of the Dodota Water Supply project by Eva Poluha, Göran Engstrand, Annika Idemalm, Johan Meichert and Judith Narowe
- 1990/2 **CENTRAL AUTHORITY BLOCKS LOCAL AUTONOMY**
An Evaluation of SIDA Support to Local Government in Zimbabwe 1983-1989 by Lennart Gustafsson, Anthony Redmond, Christopher Rambanapasi
- 1990/3 **NEW PATHS FROM POVERTY**
An Evaluation of SIDA Rural Employment Sector Support to Bangladesh 1986-1989 by Nigel Hawkesworth, Md. Masul Islam, Mahmuda Islam, Ton Jansen, Ole Lindberg, Sadrei Reza, Else Skjensberg
- 1991/1 **AID UNDER FIRE**
An Evaluation of the Mozambique-Nordic Agricultural Programme (MONAP), by Yussuf Adam, Robin Goodyear, Martin Greeley, Mick Moore, Julio Mungambe, Miguel Neves, Penelope Roberts, Gulamo Tajiri and Sergio Vieira
- 1991/2 **A FLAWED SUCCESS**
An evaluation of SIDA Support to the Kotmale Hydropower Project by Björn Gilestad, Erlend Kievan and Tor Stavsholt
- 1991/3 **THE ART OF SURVIVAL**
A study on sustainability in health projects by Lillemor Andersson-Brolin, Birgitta Lorentzon, Ole-Memiri, Elisabeth Michanek, Daniel Ndapala
- 1991/4 **KEEPING THE GOALS IN SIGHT**
An evaluation of Swedish support to public administration in Zimbabwe by Lennart Gustafsson, Peter Bunt, Duduzile Chandi-wana, Peter Gole, Charles Katiza, Desire Sibanda, Stefan Sjölander and Robert Tendere

KEEPING THE GOALS IN SIGHT

The public sector in Zimbabwe is on the threshold of fundamental change. Economic reforms will call for drastic reductions in the public sector. To meet with the new demands, the government aims to create a new style of public service in Zimbabwe: one more responsive to the public, more change-oriented, more decentralized, and generally more concerned with effectiveness and efficiency.

In the light of these changes, how relevant is the present Swedish support to the public service sector?

This evaluation, carried out in November 1990, concludes that all the subprogrammes are useful and relevant. They could well contribute to the economic and administrative reforms which lie ahead. All eight subprogrammes should therefore continue.

However, several subprogrammes have not kept their long-term goals clearly in sight: a closer monitoring and an ongoing analysis of long-term goals is recommended.

Sweden's bilateral development co-operation, administered by SIDA, comprises 19 programme countries: Angola, Bangladesh, Botswana, Cape Verde, Ethiopia, Guinea-Bissau, India, Kenya, Laos, Lesotho, Mozambique, Namibia, Nicaragua, Sri Lanka, Tanzania, Uganda, Zambia, Zimbabwe and Vietnam.

Each year about 30 of SIDA's over 200 projects are evaluated. A number of these evaluations are published in the SIDA Evaluation Report series. Copies of the reports can be ordered from SIDA, S-105 25 Stockholm, Sweden.

